What factors influence older men's learning and wellbeing through community organisations in Australia?

Keywords: men's learning, wellbeing, community organisations, lifelong learning

Paper to the First Conference of the European Society for Research into the Education of Adults (ESREA) Network on Education and Learning of Older Adults (ELOA)

7-9 October 2010, Munich Germany

Australia is experiencing an increasing older population. One of the fastest growing cohorts is older men of working age who are not in the workforce or who are retired from paid work. These men are less likely than other adults to engage in formal learning, including through adult and community education (ACE) organisations. Such older men are also vulnerable to social isolation and problems with health and wellbeing. This paper uses mixed method data (surveys and interviews) to examine what factors influence older men's learning and wellbeing through community organisations in Australia. The survey data came from a major study of learning in community settings by men over 50 years for National Seniors Productive Ageing Centre (NSPAC) involving older male participants in six sites in three Australian states. While the research was inclusive of six different types of community organisations that older men are typically affiliated with in Australia, because of the need for brevity, only three organisation types are considered in this paper: adult and community education (ACE), age-related organisations and fire and emergency service organisations. The survey questions focused on what older men learnt and what wellbeing was experienced as a consequence of their participation in these organisations. A total of 48 organisations were included in the study, resulting in extensive and rich narrative data in addition to survey data (N=219; response rate 57%). The paper is based on an analysis of the NSPAC survey data, illustrated by insights from the qualitative interview data from three organisations in only one site. Differences in learning are identified by organisation type. This research is distinctive in that it explores learning and wellbeing in communities of practice other than those understood as having only individual and educational dimensions. The paper identifies several factors aside from individual and vocational factors that enhance a desire to learn. The paper concludes that there is an absence in Australia of appropriate opportunities to address positive ageing and social isolation of men, particularly for older men not in the workforce, retired or unemployed. In this adult learning vacuum, community organisations other than ACE appear to be playing critically important, surrogate roles in helping older men to shape new and different post-work identities. The findings have important implications for adult and lifelong learning policies as well as for health and wellbeing strategies in other nations with ageing populations.
Introduction

Most education and training discourses presuppose that participants are individuals preparing for paid work. This research looks specifically and deliberately at older men (age 50+) in Australia whose likelihood of paid work has greatly diminished or vanished with age. The purpose of this paper is to carefully examine learning narratives associated with older men’s participation in three particular and very different community organisations in one site in rural Tasmania: an adult and community education provider, a fire and emergency services organisation and a residential aged care facility. It seeks particularly to explore what is hypothesized as a broad gulf between work-related learning and the learning that is sought and valued by men through participation in community organisations during later life.

Literature review

Burke (2006, p.719) noted that the discourse of lifelong learning in the United Kingdom is one that favours individualism and instrumentalism. All sectors of Australian post-compulsory education and training in 2010 can be similarly characterized as having discourses with a heavy emphasis on narrow and individual vocationalism and educational formality (Golding, Foley & Brown, 2009). Neoliberalism has transformed Australian adult education to an extent that many of the community learning functions of the remnant, state-supported adult and community education providers have been neglected or deliberately defunded by governments. And yet in Australia, as in the UK, ‘Community-based informal learning plays a critical role in widening participation among people who are educationally, economically and socially disadvantaged’ (McGivney 1999b, p.v). Sfard (2008) identified usefulness of the analogy of learning as participation compared to learning as acquisition and gaining knowledge. Sfard concluded that learning could be usefully conceived ...

... as a process of becoming a member of a certain community, so that learning is viewed as a process of becoming part of a greater whole. Where acquisition stresses an inward movement of knowledge, participation is learning interaction, where the whole and the parts affect and inform each other and the existence of the whole is fully dependent on the parts. (p.33)

Aside from research in community-based men’s sheds, summarized in Golding (2009), very few studies of Australian adult education have examined learning as a characteristic of older people’s participation in community-based organisations. Mackean’s (2010) study of older learners in Tasmania is one exception. For this reason, it is necessary and useful to look beyond Australia at research into other models of adult education provision in order to make comparisons of learning in community contexts by older Australians. Oosterlinck (2010), for example, undertook a case study of adult education in the Flanders region of Belgium. Oosterlinck (2010) observed that in Flanders, by law, ‘Learning processes are not only set up in order to educate the individual, but to optimize the way our society operates’ (p.15). However he concluded that the educational function of the set of socio-cultural organisations he examined in Flanders was in ‘dire straits’. That research sought, as the current research
attempts in Australia, to postulate that the socio-cultural education function of community organisations should go beyond the sum of individual competencies to include social learning.

Method

The narrative data from the three community organisations discussed in this paper are drawn from those collected in the small town of Oatlands (population 540) in rural Tasmania. The data comprise a small part of a very large body of interview and survey data from a study of older men’s learning and wellbeing through community organisations by Golding, Foley, Brown and Harvey (2009). The larger study involved focus group interviews and surveys (N=219) with older men (age 50+) in six selected organisation types in each of six diverse sites, including Oatlands, across three Australian states. The six community organisation types in the larger study included adult and community education (ACE), religious or Indigenous and age-related organisations as well as sporting, volunteer fire and emergency services, and men’s special interest organisations. These organisations were selected because they were inclusive of older men across the Australian community and provided ethical access to men of all ages, both in and out of work, who had not necessarily had recent education and training experience.

The total number of surveys in the larger study was sufficient to undertake sub-group analysis by organisation type, including Chi square tests of significance. In the quantitative results reported immediately below, p indicates the probability that the result reported is due to statistical chance. Values of p<0.05 (in effect, a probability of less than a one in 20) are taken to be statistically significant.

The qualitative data in the current paper are limited, because of its brevity, to illustrative narratives from only three Oatlands organisations: a residential aged care centre, a volunteer rural fire brigade and adult education on-line access centre. While the three Oatlands organisations selected for analysis (from the six organisations studied in Oatlands) comprise only a small fraction of the 48 organisations studied nationally, they illustrate narrative themes observed in the wider study. The rich, narrative insights from only eight men interviewed in two organisations are used to illustrate Beck’s (1986, pp.115-120) general contention that in reflexive modernity,

There is no more a general consensus about common norms and behaviour.
Individuals live in different situations where they each construct their own identity, the ‘do-it-yourself biography’.

The hypothesis in presenting these older men’s narratives in such detail is that valuable learning for many older men is much more likely to occur though meeting and participating in different ways than it does through education.

The research method, detailed in Golding, Foley, Brown & Harvey (NSPAC 2009), involved two site visits. The first reconnaissance visit involved discussions with organisation representatives. The second visit involved participant focus group interviews and surveys. The survey items and techniques were adapted from those used in previous men’s sheds research (Golding, Brown, Foley, Harvey &
Gleeson, 2007) to address the new research questions about men’s learning and wellbeing. Interview and survey questions applied specifically to men as active participants in each community organisation. All interviews were audio recorded, typically for approximately 30 minutes. The transcript data from older male participants were analyzed for key themes and by organisation. The men’s names used in this paper are pseudonyms in order to ethically protect participant confidentiality.

Quantitative comparisons about learning in three organisation types

An analysis of the learning-related survey data from all six Australian sites (48 organisations) confirmed significant differences between older men’s perceptions of learning in the six different organisation types. The comparisons below and the narratives that follow are restricted, because of the need for brevity, to three organisation types: fire and emergency service organisations, adult and community education and age-related organisations. Older men who participated in these three organisations types are shown, through the quantitative data below, to have significantly different self-reported learning needs and preferences.

Factors that attract and engage older men in three community settings

Of all six organisation types, voluntary fire and emergency services organisation participants were significantly more interested, active and engaged, ‘hands-on’ learners. On average, as a group, they were more interested than older male participants in adult and community education providers to do more learning, but not through the local adult or community education provider. Older men involved were significantly more interested, even than adult and community education participants, in more learning in a course that leads to a qualification (p<0.001). Fire and emergency services volunteers were also significantly more likely to agree (p<0.014) that they were interested in hands-on learning, (p<0.001), to have attended a formal learning program in the past year, to have played a leadership role in the organisation (p<0.000) and been active participants in the organisation (p<0.001). They were also significantly more likely to agree that they did not feel comfortable about going to the local adult learning organisation.

By contrast, while older men in adult and community education (ACE) were more interested in classroom-based learning (p<0.004), they were much less likely to be active participants in the organisation (p<0.001) and significantly less likely to be interested in hands-on learning (p<0.014).

Older men in age-related organisations differed yet again in their attitudes towards learning. They were significantly less likely than other men to be interested in a course to get a qualification (p<0.001) or in hands-on learning (p<0.014). Like fire volunteers, older men in age-related organisations were significantly less comfortable about going to the local adult learning organisation (p<0.008), but significantly more likely to agree that their opportunities to learn were affected by their health (p<0.043).
The types of learning that are experienced and valued

While 93 per cent of all older men surveyed across all six organisation types in Australia agreed that they were ‘keen to learn more’ through the organisation, it is important to put the learning they experienced in its wider context. Firstly, the learning had very little to do with paid work. Of all the older men surveyed, only eleven per cent expected to get more paid work as a result of participating. Secondly, only 46 per cent of all older men surveyed agreed that they would be interested in taking part in more learning opportunities, if they were available through the organisation, though an additional 36 per cent said ‘maybe’ rather than ‘no’.

While older men generally reported that their skills had improved as a result of participating in the organisation (77% agreement for social skills, 72% agreement for communication or literacy skills and 61% for organisation skills), the strongest agreement had to do with identity, enjoyment, belonging, being accepted and giving back to the community. Virtually all men agreed that as a consequence of participating they felt better about themselves (98% agreement), were doing what they enjoyed (96% agreement), had a place where they belonged (91% agreement), could give back to the community (90% agreement) and also felt more accepted in the community. Consistent with these findings, while most older men regarded the organisation as a place to learn new skills (84% agreement), even more saw it as a place to meet new friends (93% agreement), keep them healthy and give back to the community (88% agreement for both).

Qualitative comparisons about learning in three organisations

The narrative data from interviews in three organisations (italicized) in one rural Tasmanian site (Oatlands) are used below to illustrate and ‘tease out’ the trends observed in the national survey and interview data are reported in the NSPAC research.

Adult and Community Education: Oatlands On Line Access Centre

Oatlands On Line Access Centre was the only active, publicly supported adult education provider in 2009 in the small town of Oatlands, since the prominently signposted Oatlands Community House and the Central Tasmanian Community College were now respectively dormant and defunct. While Adult Community Education (ACE) organisations used to exist in many other towns like Oatlands in most Australian states, by 2009 neo-liberal training agendas had greatly reduced their coverage. By 2001 the only Australian state that retained a comprehensive, state-funded, adult and community education sector was Victoria, though it too was moving in 2010 to privilege and fund vocational education and training over what it called ‘pre-vocational learning’. By 2009 in Australia’s most populous state, New South Wales, the slogans ‘meeting our community’s training needs’ and ‘real jobs for real people’ along with the terms ‘College’ and ‘Community College’ had become an intrinsic part of the advertising in ACE providers.
In Tasmania, a series of government reviews and restructures had reduced the ACE presence in Oatlands to an information and communications technology (ICT) centre connected to the local secondary school. It was not providing ‘second chance education and training opportunities’ that the Tasmanian government originally intended such centres would do when set up a decade ago. While a small number of women were using the ICT services, very few men were involved either as participants or volunteers. Too few men over 50 years old were using any of the On Line Access Centre services for it to participate in the surveys or interviews. In effect, the adult learning opportunities available through the Centre were arguably totally inappropriate for most men in Oatlands.

**Volunteer fire and emergency services organisation: Oatlands Fire Brigade**

*Oatlands Fire Brigade*, like most fire and emergency service organisations in small Australian towns, was centrally located, seldom needed but always ready. While the number of people, mainly older men, involved as volunteers was small, the proportion of the small and rural Oatlands community involved was high, and there was some crossover between roles. In the case of road accidents, all three services often attended and closely collaborated. The jobs required more than technical skill, including some community service work, which was challenging for state emergency services (SES) volunteers, as a team leader stressed.

Some of the stuff on the side of the road is really gruesome. We have to cut bodies out and pickup the bits and pieces up and clear the bodies of cars. ... But that’s part of the game, the community service and support. While 70 per cent of the volunteer ambulance work in Oatlands involves ‘domestic’ work, 30 per cent of it is sometimes horrific, road trauma.

As in many smaller towns with ageing populations, these emergency service volunteers, almost all men, were also ageing and had multiple work and community roles. The five men interviewed included men from all three services and ranged in age from: ‘Les’, 54 and Fire Brigade Captain; ‘Noel’, 55 and SES team Leader; ‘Colin’, 56 and fire service member; ‘Ray’ 64 and Volunteer Ambulance Officer, to Fire Service member, ‘Jack’ who was 67, a former police officer, the only retired interviewee and the most recent volunteer. Most of the men had long histories in this or similar voluntary fire or emergency services organisations.

Les explained the training, the fire brigade’s role and the minimum training needed to get on the fire truck.

*We have a two-hour practice ... every month ... We have a run, ensure that things are clean and tidy, reports up to date, the gear on the trucks is working properly. ... We handle all fires. Also we cover the Midlands Highway ... and we have a high incidence of vehicle accidents ... [The minimum level of training is the] Basic Fire Fighting Course. It’s a two-day run through of everything after an introduction to the Brigade.*

Les described the fire training and assessment options.
[If] someone comes along with interest [in training] we have a self-assessment [and] a program over a period of weeks or months that we basically put them through up to a level that we feel that they are ready. Then we opt to send them away to our fire service [headquarters] to do a full weekend, to do everything formally and when they come back they qualify. ... Then [they] go on as firemen and ride the truck and then from there on they pick the courses that they require going up the level into pump and fire suppression ... they can go through to officer levels and hazardous chemicals.

In the case of the training for the ambulance service, Ray explained that ...

Our supervisors come down ... each month. ...They keep you up to scratch with your training and most of the time we assess ourselves on jobs and come back and say what we could have done right and what we did do right and talk about it and go from there.

Ray at 64 had been in the volunteer role for more than half his life and being on call every second week, sensed it was time for him to step aside but it was hard to find new members with the commitment and 'stomach' for the difficult work.

Colin reflected on what he had learned on his several decades of fire service.

Probably the most important thing is that you learn that everyone is human ... Different people have got different capabilities, different people have got different levels that you can put them to ... I mean I know [Noel's] skills, he knows mine ... and that flows into the day to day jobs. I know that I can go and say to [Noel], "Can you do this?" Whereas it might be a totally different role to what I would ask [Jack] to do.

I guess [you get] satisfaction knowing that you have done something great or good. ... [You learn] control, being able to have control at the scene of an accident. [A while ago] this senior guy called me in [after an incident] and when I walked away he shook hands and said, "Good job mate", and I think that is comradeship. That is where the rewards come as far as I am concerned, just knowing that you have done a good job, or done it to the best of your ability ...

Age related organisations: Oatlands Multipurpose Health Centre

The Oatlands Multipurpose Health Centre is set on a large, grassy block behind the Oatlands main street. The three men in permanent residential care who volunteered for interview lived in various parts of the complex, including 'Errol', age 79, who as a result of a stroke required a wheelchair and only had one 'good' arm, but which was still good enough to take part in the gardening activities. Several of these older Oatlands men had recently decided to set up a vegetable garden on part of the Health Centre lawn, and the Centre kitchen was using the produce.

‘Frank’ had been a farmer and was very polite and quietly spoken. There weren’t many things ‘Wally’, hadn’t done in his 67 years before being brought to the Centre in desperate need of care. More than in other interviews, this narrative has been pasted together with often short, one sentence fragments from the men’s typically short but thoughtful comments and responses.

Errol explained that he:
... had that stroke and they wouldn't look after me at home, so I had to go somewhere didn't I?

Errol was understandably frustrated but satisfied by the 'limited amount' he could still do with one good arm from a wheelchair, including hoeing their vegetable garden.

[It's] exercise of a different sort, like moving your arm mightn't seem much but it's doing good somewhere isn't it? ... You feel satisfied when you achieve something, don't you? ... We have had two or three feeds of new potatoes and green peas.

Errol still went up the main street on a good day.

Well I find if I feel all right, I go for a walk up the street if it's a nice day, I go window-shopping ... There's an antique shop up here, its very interesting to look at the junk or whatever. [On a wet day] I read ... there's nothing much else you can do ... I watch TV ... If there's football on I like to watch that, and if it's raining I listen to that. It hasn't rained for six to seven years.

Wally gave a potted history of his life.

Teaching in the army, working with books, sorting, working ... in Melbourne as a metal worker ... I came out of [a rural town]. I was there for 15 years and I have been here [in the residential facility for] a year. [I came here because] I was spending more time at the hospital here [than at home]. ... I would like to be [home] but I can't be ... As soon as I get back home I would probably be on the phone for an ambulance.

A few years after returning from war service Wally ... ... [was] on medication, and when I drank beer I would go off my head and start fighting and end up in the lockup and that sort of thing. ... I didn't [associate it with war service] at the time, but probably do now. A lot of the blokes that I was with there either committed suicide or have 'gone off their trolley' at one time or the other. Most of the blokes that I know, if they are still married, they are not living with the same wife as they started off with.

Wally was now passionately involved in the garden. He described what was in season and reflected philosophically on the sudden onset of retirement and his recent life in care.

I don't get involved [in programs]. ... The most I do is a resident's meeting or barbecue ... Bingo doesn't grab me at all. ... [Retirement] comes all of a sudden ... it's inevitable, it's going to happen to everyone isn't it? ... I think if we accept what we have got and should be grateful. There would be something that you would want but we must accept what we get and that's it because it is good enough. I would like to go out the bush every day with a chain saw and get some wood but I have to accept that I can't go. ... Well that's what I have always done. That's the biggest problem, I think, is to change from one life to an entirely different one ... But we have to accept what we've got and I think everyone has and we are thankful for it.

Frank, now 83, had done a lot till it 'came to a sudden stop' when he divorced and moved to the Health Centre in Oatlands.

I started farming, when the boys grew up for higher education and moved to [the capital city]. I had several jobs down there. ... [Then I] just kept the farm going until I moved in here and then came to a sudden stop. ... When you retire, you retire. ... I took up reading .. The [paper], ... magazines. ... Physical exercises in the day room, ... twice a week, ... kicking balloons around from one to the other so you
have got your presence of mind. ... [I most enjoy] sitting in the sun and reading. I don't [enjoy the social activities]. ... I don't join in at all.

Frank talked about how he came to be at the Centre and how he felt as a 'solitary person' about being there.

I grew up with elderly parents. I am not quite myself and wanted to make sure that my son didn't have the worry of the parents, I was living on my own I woke up after three days of rather a mess and at least coming in here my son doesn't have the worry of the parents [dying] on them. They were pushing for [me to come here]. ... They seemed to get sick of me and thought it was a good idea for me [to come here] anyway. ... When I was [in Hospital] there were five [of us] with strokes and each one ... lost our wives in the eight months period prior to when we had the strokes, and they reckon that's the cause of the strokes. If you could go back to what you used to do, well [Wally] would have had his occupation [too]. If he could go back and do that for say only two or three days it would feel different altogether, wouldn't it mate? (Spoken to Wally)

Wally replied to Frank.

He would like to go back to that bloody farm. That’s how I feel now, I used to get up every fortnight and take the dogs and the gun and go recreation shooting. Well there’s nothing I would like better than that ... But it’s something that you have to accept that you can’t do, you have to accept [this ...] a cup of tea in the conference room, don’t you? ... [I don’t have privacy or freedom here]. Being a solitary person, it doesn’t go down well. ... When you go back to what your normal life was out in the bush and do the things you used to do, you feel entirely different ... its natural isn’t it?

The three men were asked what they got out of doing the garden. Wally found that it ...

... Fills in the time. [It's] better than sitting in my room by myself. You get sick of reading or watching videos, well I do anyway. Plus you can go around and torment anyone else that is around. ... I like reading the big gardening books and that makes a difference. Yes I have still got a couple up there.

Discussion

It is only possible to compare older men’s experiences of adult and community education in Oatlands with their experiences in other organisations by default. The only adult and community education provider in Oatlands had very few services or programs of interest or relevance to most older men. Using the key words from the title of McGivney’s (1999a) study of men’s learning in the UK, while men were not ‘excluded’ from the On Line Access Centre, older men were certainly and conspicuously ‘missing’. The survey data from participants in other Australian sites confirm that adult and community education did not provide the necessary opportunities for older men to learn the way they preferred: by regularly meeting socially and engaging with the organisation.

By contrast, the narratives from the voluntary fire and emergency service organisation confirm that the training, though accredited, was actively and regularly embraced. While the training was a necessary prerequisite of active participation in these organisations, most of what older men learnt and valued
derived from the rich community of practice, working voluntarily in teams over decades in trusting relationships with other men. In this organisation, the training was regular, hands-on, accredited and oriented to future emergencies. However what older men were seeking and learning as participants was much deeper and broader, and acquired over many years through a rich community of shared practice. If one was to create a new ‘ideal’ learning organisation to engage a wide range of men including older men, it might have pedagogies similar to Australian fire and emergency services organisations (Hayes, Golding & Harvey, 2004).

Narratives from older men in the Oatlands aged care setting illustrated that men had been forced, often suddenly and through changed life circumstances (ageing, disability, loss of partner, need for nursing and aged care) to reluctantly move and live permanently in a very different place. Removed from familiar places, people, interests and resources, they were required to take on very different identities. What they enjoyed sharing with other men were reminiscences about old times and the ‘hands-on’ life skills. They were reluctant to be taught as students, socialized as clients or patronized as patients. Here, the older men were much less interested in learning new things. They were most interested in sharing what they already knew and could do to create new and very personal understandings about their diverse and often difficult and much changed, identities in later life.

What the NSPAC survey and narrative data suggests, is that learning in later life is qualitatively different from and often totally unrelated to vocational learning. While adult and community education organisations position themselves as learning organisations, organisations involving communities of hands-on practice, such as voluntary fire and emergency services organisations, are in several respects more accessible to and accommodating of older men’s preferred learning pedagogies than Australian adult education and training (ACE) providers. While both organisation types typically provide nationally accredited training, unlike ACE organisations, fire and emergency services organisations, require participants to meet regularly, maintain current competencies, take on positions of responsibility and work in teams. The survey data from older men in age-related organisations, combined with the qualitative data, are indicative of minimal or no interest in accredited learning, but a greater need to make and maintain relationships, do hands-on things together and learn to stay as fit and healthy as possible as they age.

Conclusion

The data and narratives examined, in their totality in these three different organisation contexts, lead to the conclusion that much learning for older men in later life is essentially ontological, about being, rather than cognitive, or about knowing. Through learning is undertaken under a range of other guises (vocational, community emergency service-oriented, therapeutic and leisure) consistent with different community organisation purposes, it is in many important and powerful senses re-creational, in that older men are struggling with new identities. Learning, even when it has a pragmatic purpose and is
undertaken in a practical setting, allows men to actively redefine and re-create personal meanings and identities other than those they developed through paid work.

While the conclusions from three community organisations in one small, rural Australian town cannot be extrapolated nationally, data from the wider NSPAC study (Golding, Foley, Brown & Harvey, 2009) confirm that there is an absence in Australia of appropriate opportunities to address positive ageing and social isolation of men, particularly for older men not in the workforce or unemployed. With a very weak and deliberately emasculated government-funded adult learning sector, Australian community organisations other than adult and community education are playing critically important, surrogate roles in helping older men to participate and shape new and different post-work identities. The findings have important implications for adult and lifelong learning policies as well as for health and wellbeing strategies in other nations with ageing populations.

References


McGivney, V. (1999a). Excluded men: Men who are missing from education and training. Leicester: NIACE.

